2016 ANNUAL REPORT
OF THE
ASSEMBLY STANDING COMMITTEE ON HOUSING
KEITH L.T. WRIGHT, CHAIR

Members of the Committee

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Majority</th>
<th>Minority</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Vivian E. Cook</td>
<td>Michael J. Fitzpatrick, Ranking Minority Member</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Annette M. Robinson</td>
<td>Andrew P. Raia</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Linda B. Rosenthal</td>
<td>Christopher S. Friend</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Brian Kavanagh</td>
<td>Al Graf</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Michael P. Kearns</td>
<td>Mark Johns</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Francisco P. Moya</td>
<td>Steve Katz</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Robert J. Rodriguez</td>
<td>Raymond Walter</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Luis R. Sepúlveda</td>
<td>Ronald Castorina Jr.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Walter T. Mosley</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ron Kim</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Victor M. Pichardo</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Guillermo Linares</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latrice Walker</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Latoya Joyner</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Michael Blake</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Erik M. Dilan</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Rodneyse Bichotte</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maritza Davila</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alice Cancel</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Staff

Giovanni Warren, Assistant Secretary for Program and Policy
Sara Neitzel, Associate Counsel
Michael Szydlo, Senior Analyst
Jeanine R. Johnson, Chief of Staff
Francisco Polanco, Committee Clerk
Table of Contents

I. COMMITTEE JURISDICTION AND PURVIEW .................................................. 3

II. 2016 LEGISLATIVE HIGHLIGHTS ................................................................ 4

A. Rent Regulation ......................................................................................... 4
   Submetering Rent Reduction Schedules ..................................................... 4
   Curtailing the Inappropriate Use of Preferential Rents .............................. 4
   Major Capital Improvement Rent Adjustments .......................................... 5
   Vacancy Rent Increases ............................................................................. 5
   Major Capital Improvement Modifications ............................................. 5

B. Mitchell-Lama Public Housing ................................................................. 5
   Four-Year Moratorium and Program Study .............................................. 5
   Income Thresholds .................................................................................. 6
   Additional Information Regarding Buy-Outs .......................................... 6

C. Public Housing ......................................................................................... 6
   Adding Legal Occupants to a Lease .......................................................... 7
   Notice upon Denial of Request ................................................................. 7
   Notice to Mobility-Impaired Tenants ......................................................... 7
   Notice of Opportunity to Meet to Discuss Possible Termination of Tenancy .. 7
   Relates to Sidewalk Shed Permit Renewals ......................................... 7

D. Other Legislation ...................................................................................... 8
   Refinancing Provisions in Ground Leases ............................................... 8
   Bedbug Inspection and Extermination ..................................................... 8
   Reviewing and Reporting on Section 3 Projects ..................................... 8
   Prohibiting Certain Advertising Relating to Multiple Dwelling Units ...... 8
   State of New York Mortgage Agency Mortgage Insurance Fund .......... 9
   Bonding Authority of the New York City Housing Development Corporation . 9
   Bond and Note Authorization by the Housing Finance Agency and the State of New York Mortgage Agency ........................................................... 9
   Establishes the Community Restoration Fund ....................................... 10

III. SFY 2016-2017 BUDGET HIGHLIGHTS .................................................. 11

A. Division of Housing and Community Renewal Capital Projects .......... 11

B. Aid to Localities .................................................................................... 12

C. The Mortgage Insurance Fund ............................................................ 13

IV. LEGISLATIVE HEARINGS ............................................................................. 14

APPENDIX A ................................................................................................... 15

APPENDIX B ................................................................................................... 16

APPENDIX C ................................................................................................... 18
I. COMMITTEE JURISDICTION AND PURVIEW

The New York State Assembly Standing Committee on Housing is responsible for legislation on housing development and preservation. Its purview includes rent regulation, as well as legislation amending the following areas of the New York State Law:

- *Multiple Dwelling Law*, which encompasses health and safety standards for buildings with three or more families living independently of each other in New York City, and any other city, town, or village that has chosen to adopt the law;

- *Multiple Residence Law*, which covers health and safety standards for buildings with three or more families living independently of each other in all cities, towns, and villages outside of New York City;

- *Private Housing Finance Law*, which governs the following entities and programs: Mitchell-Lama; Limited Dividend Housing Companies; Low Income Housing Trust Fund; Affordable Home Ownership Development; Permanent Housing for Homeless Families; Manufactured Home Cooperative Fund; Housing Development Fund Companies; Neighborhood Preservation Companies; Rural Area Revitalization; Rural Rental Assistance; Urban Initiatives; Rural and Urban Community Investment Fund; several New York City programs; and the administration of the New York State Housing Finance Agency and New York City Housing Development Corporation; and

- *Public Housing Law*, which covers the safety, management, and financing of local public housing authorities throughout the State.

In addition to these laws, the Committee has jurisdiction over legislation amending housing-related sections of the Executive Law, Real Property Law, Real Property Actions and Proceedings Law, and Public Authorities Law – and the following unconsolidated areas of New York Law: the Emergency Housing Rent Control Law; the Local Emergency Housing Rent Control Law; the New York City Rent Stabilization Law; the Emergency Tenant Protection Act of 1974; sections of the New York City Administrative Code and the City of Buffalo Administrative Code; and sections of the General Business Law that relate to the conversion of real property from rental to cooperative or condominium status.
II. 2016 LEGISLATIVE HIGHLIGHTS

A. Rent Regulation

Rent regulation laws protect tenants residing in rent-stabilized or rent-controlled apartments in New York City as well as in Nassau, Rockland, and Westchester counties. A large majority of rent-regulated tenants reside in New York City. Initial findings from the 2014 New York City Housing and Vacancy Survey (HVS), conducted by the U.S. Census Bureau, estimate that there are approximately 1.057 million rent-regulated units within New York City, representing around 48.4 percent of the City’s total rental housing stock.

For rent regulation laws to apply, a municipality must declare a rental housing emergency – defined as a housing stock vacancy rate of 5 percent or lower. According to the 2014 HVS, the vacancy rate in New York City and some surrounding counties remains under 5 percent, with the two most recent reports showing a New York City vacancy rate of 3.12 percent in 2011, and 3.45 percent in 2014. Due to the existence of this emergency, intervention is critical to protect tenants from unreasonable rent increases and evictions.

Listed below is legislation related to rent regulation intended to protect tenants and maintain the fairness of the laws governing these housing units.

1. Submetering Rent Reduction Schedules
   A.658 (Hevesi); Passed Assembly

   This bill would require the Division of Housing and Community Renewal (DHCR) to formulate and publish a schedule of rent adjustments relating to the conversion to individual metering in buildings that factored electricity into the base rent prior to the conversion to direct metering or submetering in order to facilitate fair rent reductions. Upon the building’s conversion, this bill would require all tenants to be responsible for their own electric consumption except for those already receiving certain rent-increase exemptions.

2. Curtailing the Inappropriate Use of Preferential Rents
   A.3809-A (Wright); Passed Assembly

   A preferential rent is a rent amount that an owner agrees to charge, which is lower than the legal regulated rent. This bill would prohibit owners from discontinuing use of the preferential rent terms upon the renewal of a tenant’s lease. It would also prohibit an increase in the preferential rent upon vacancy if the vacancy is caused by the landlord’s violation of the warranty of habitability.
3. **Major Capital Improvement Rent Adjustments**  
A.3957-A (Wright); Passed Assembly

This bill would require that major capital improvement (MCI) rent adjustments be offset by the total amount, or 100 percent, of any annual tax abatement benefits received. Adjustments would also be offset by any tax abatement benefits that were received prior to such adjustments, if they are a result of participation in the J-51 program. The current statute requires that MCI rent adjustments only be offset by 50 percent of such annual tax abatements received.

4. **Vacancy Rent Increases**  
A.5567 (Kavanagh); Passed Assembly

This bill would repeal the provisions of law that authorize rent increases of up to 20 percent upon vacancy; however, other legally allowable rent increases could still occur. This would reduce the incentive for landlords to artificially induce turnover in rent-regulated apartments.

5. **Major Capital Improvement Modifications**  
A.6054-A (Kavanagh); Passed Assembly

This bill would establish that rental increases associated with major capital improvements (MCIs) are to be surcharges to the legal regulated rent, and must therefore be separately designated and billed as such. Currently, expenses for MCIs in rental housing are recovered in seven years, based on the permissible monthly rent increase. The proposed surcharge for MCIs would cease after the cost of improvements are recovered. Lastly, the bill would cap MCI rent increases to six percent of the monthly rent collected.

**B. Mitchell-Lama Public Housing**

Since the 1950s, the Mitchell-Lama program has provided affordable housing to moderate-income New Yorkers. More than 250 Mitchell-Lama developments exist throughout the State. The continued viability of this program remains a critical part of the Committee’s effort to ensure the availability of affordable housing for the citizens of New York.

To date, owners of thousands of apartments have left the program by repaying loans issued under the Private Housing Finance Law. These “buy-outs” can have a devastating impact on the families living in these developments, as rents can increase significantly when existing leases expire.

1. **Four-Year Moratorium and Program Study**  
A.3682 (Wright); Passed Assembly

This bill would prevent any rental Mitchell-Lama development from voluntarily dissolving from the program for a period of four years. During the four-year moratorium, New York State Homes and Community Renewal, in consultation with the New York...
City Department of Housing Preservation & Development, would undertake a comprehensive study on the preservation, sustainability, reform, and growth of the Mitchell-Lama housing program.

2. **Income Thresholds**  
   A.3728 (Wright); Passed Assembly

   This bill would adjust the aggregate household income threshold of persons or families in the Mitchell-Lama program to eight times the rental amount, including the value or cost of heat, light, water, and cooking fuel for their household. However, in the case of families that have three or more dependents, such ratio would be adjusted to 9:1.

3. **Additional Information Regarding Buy-Outs**  
   A.7973 (Blake); Passed Assembly

   This bill would require the State Division of Housing and Community Renewal (DHCR) to include, in its annual report on the Mitchell-Lama program, information regarding any limited-profit housing company that has voluntarily dissolved in the preceding calendar year as well as any limited-profit housing company that has filed, with the Commissioner of DHCR and the supervising agency, a notice of its intent to dissolve in the following year. The bill specifies the additional information that must be included in the annual report.

   This bill would also require DHCR to submit the annual report to the State Comptroller and the Attorney General. Currently, DHCR is only required to submit its annual Mitchell-Lama program report to the State Legislature.

C. **Public Housing**

   The Committee on Housing continues to play an important role in regulating and supporting the operation of public housing. There are around 180 housing authorities across New York State. Of these, the largest is the New York City Housing Authority, which serves almost 400,000 residents through its public housing programs comprised of more than 300 public housing developments throughout the five boroughs.

   Public housing developments play an important role in the State’s efforts to provide affordable housing, but they are also in desperate need of assistance to make long-overdue capital improvements. Due to inadequate levels of federal dollars and funding from the State’s Public Housing Modernization program over the last decade, many of these developments continue to languish, despite the pressing need for maintenance and repairs.
1. **Adding Legal Occupants to a Lease**  
A.1477 (Wright); Passed Assembly

This bill would give residents of the New York City Housing Authority notice of their ability to add a legal occupant to their leases. The bill would also ensure that requests for documents to add a legal occupant are fulfilled.

2. **Notice upon Denial of Request**  
A.4102 (Wright); Chapter 335 of the Laws of 2016

This new law requires the New York City Housing Authority to provide a tenant, upon the denial of any request that would permit a tenant to institute a grievance procedure, with a written notice specifically articulating its reasons for denial.

3. **Notice to Mobility-Impaired Tenants**  
A.4232 (Titus); Passed Assembly

This bill would direct the New York City Housing Authority to give mobility-impaired tenants first notice when a unit becomes available on a lower floor, provided that the vacant unit is the same size, or smaller than, the unit occupied by such tenant.

4. **Notice of Opportunity to Meet to Discuss Possible Termination of Tenancy**  
A.8140-A (Wright); Chapter 340 of the Laws of 2016

This new law requires the New York City Housing Authority (NYCHA), when mailing a notice regarding a pre-termination meeting to a household having an authorized occupant over the age of 62 years, to include with such notice a notification informing the tenant that he or she has the opportunity to meet with the property manager, or his or her designee, to discuss the possible termination of tenancy. Such notice would be mailed to such households by certified mail.

The property manager, or his or her designee, is required to schedule a pre-termination meeting no more than seven days after the date such notice is mailed. The meeting could occur up to 14 days after the date of mailing, upon a tenant’s request. The pre-termination notice would have to be mailed at least 45 days before the date of a termination of tenancy hearing. NYCHA would not be permitted to provide less than 15 days’ notice before the date of a termination of tenancy hearing if the charges are based on non-desirability.

5. **Relates to Sidewalk Shed Permit Renewals**  
A.9205 (Rodriguez); Chapter 18 of the Laws of 2016

This new law clarifies that the provisions of Chapter 520 of the Laws of 2015, in relation to certain permit renewals, are actually in relation to sidewalk shed permits. In addition, language is added to ensure continued public safety by requiring the New York City Commissioner of the Department of Buildings, if he or she determines that removing a
sidewalk shed would expose the public to potential harm, to issue a one-time renewal of such sidewalk shed permit for a one-year period.

D. Other Legislation

1. **Refinancing Provisions in Ground Leases**
   A.3391-A (Braunstein); Passed Assembly

   This bill would clarify existing procedures and establish new procedures related to refinancing provisions in ground leases. Ground leases are long-term leases of real property that allow the tenant to construct, improve, or renovate structures upon the property.

2. **Bedbug Inspection and Extermination**
   A.5723 (Hooper); Passed Assembly

   This bill would allow an owner who has knowledge that bedbugs are present in a dwelling to inspect the dwelling for the presence of bedbugs upon 48 hours’ notice to all tenants. The bill would also require the owner to keep the premises free from infestations of bedbugs through eradication measures. The owner would be required to provide written notice of at least 48 hours to the tenant or tenants before the implementation of eradication measures.

3. **Reviewing and Reporting on Section 3 Projects**
   A.7617-A (Blake); Passed Assembly

   This bill would require the State Division of Housing and Community Renewal (DHCR) to promulgate regulations, rules, and policies that provide for the review and determination of compliance with Section 3 of the federal Housing and Urban Development Act of 1968. The Commissioner of DHCR would be required to submit a report every six months detailing the findings of such investigation to the Speaker and Minority Leader of the Assembly, and the Temporary President and Minority Leader of the Senate.

   The federal Section 3 program requires that recipients of certain HUD financial assistance, to the greatest extent possible, provide job training, employment, and contract opportunities to low-income or very low-income residents in connection with projects and activities in their neighborhoods.

4. **Prohibiting Certain Advertising Relating to Multiple Dwelling Units**
   A.8704-C (Rosenthal); Chapter 396 of the Laws of 2016

   In 2010, the Legislature clarified and strengthened the law regarding transient occupancy in class A multiple dwellings to specify that permanent residency of such a dwelling means at least 30 consecutive days’ occupancy by a natural person or family in a unit (“the permanent occupants”). Permanent occupants are permitted to allow occupancy of
the dwelling unit for less than 30 consecutive days, provided that there is no monetary compensation for any lawful boarders, roomers, lodgers, or house guests living within the household while the permanent occupants are temporarily absent for vacation or other personal reasons. Permanent occupants are allowed to provide occupancy in their dwelling units for monetary compensation, regardless of the length of stay, as long as the permanent occupants remain residing in the same unit. The prohibition against transient occupancy in these dwellings was instituted to ensure that all buildings comply with fire, building and other safety codes relative to their class.

The 2016 law prohibits the advertisement for the occupancy or use of a dwelling unit within a class A multiple dwelling in New York City in violation of the 2010 law. Violators would be subject to civil penalties of up to $1,000 for a first violation, up to $5,000 for a second violation, and up to $7,500 for a third and/or subsequent violations. This law will be enforced in New York City by the mayor’s Office of Special Enforcement.

5. **State of New York Mortgage Agency Mortgage Insurance Fund**  
   A.10497 (Wright); Chapter 158 of the Laws of 2016

   This bill would authorize the State of New York Mortgage Agency Mortgage Insurance Fund (MIF) to invest in Government National Mortgage Association (GNMA) mortgage backed securities, which are explicitly backed by the full faith and credit of the U.S. Government. GNMA is a self-sustaining, profitable and wholly-owned government corporation located within the U.S. Department of Housing and Urban Development.

6. **Bonding Authority of the New York City Housing Development Corporation**  
   A.10562 (Wright); Chapter 470 of the Laws of 2016

   This bill would authorize the New York City Housing Development Corporation to increase the maximum aggregate principal amount of its outstanding bonds and notes from $11.25 billion to $12.5 billion.

7. **Bond and Note Authorization by the Housing Finance Agency and the State of New York Mortgage Agency**  
   A.10668 (Gjonaj); Chapter 163 of the Laws of 2016

   This law increases the bonding authority of the New York State Housing Finance Agency (HFA) by $2.5 billion to a maximum aggregate of $24.2 billion. It also increases the taxable bonding authority of the State of New York Mortgage Agency (SONYMA) by $200 million to a maximum aggregate of $1 billion, which would be used to accommodate its new special mortgage program aimed at buyers purchasing properties in neighborhoods severely impacted by the foreclosure crisis along with the continuing need to fund its other programs. The law also establishes new maximum income limit provisions in the SONYMA statute to be applicable to the special mortgage program.
8. **Establishes the Community Restoration Fund**
   A.10730 (Weinstein); Chapter 72 of the Laws of 2016

This law amends the State of New York Mortgage Agency to create the New York State Community Restoration Fund to assist homeowners who are either delinquent on their mortgage payments or are in danger of going into default because of economic hardship. The creation of the Community Restoration Fund will help communities throughout the state by: (i) minimizing foreclosures, (ii) reducing blight, (iii) restoring property tax revenue, and (iv) supporting affordable housing options.

Community development financial institutions, not-for-profits, housing counseling agencies, land banks, and/or other local government entities across the state could use available funds to acquire, purchase, or sell residences and/or mortgage notes in order to keep homeowners in their homes, rehabilitate distressed properties, or demolish dilapidated homes.
III. SFY 2016-2017 BUDGET HIGHLIGHTS

A. Division of Housing and Community Renewal Capital Projects

**Multi-Year Housing Program**

$1.97 billion

These funds will be made available in accordance with a multi-year housing plan to support the preservation or creation of 100,000 affordable housing units and the creation and operation of 6,000 supportive housing units.

The allocation of these funds is subject to a plan approved in a memorandum of understanding executed by the Executive, Speaker of the Assembly, and Majority Leader of the Senate.

**Low Income Housing Trust Fund**

$42 million

The Low Income Housing Trust Fund provides funding to not-for-profits, localities, and private developers for the construction or rehabilitation of affordable rental housing for low-income households. The $47.7 million total resulted from a combination of capital appropriations and money drawn from the Mortgage Insurance Fund’s reserves.

**Affordable Housing Corporation**

$26 million

This program provides grants and loans of up to $35,000 per unit (plus an additional $5,000 in high-cost areas) for rehabilitation and new construction of one- to four-family dwellings for low- and moderate-income New Yorkers.

**Homes for Working Families Program**

$14 million

The Homes for Working Families program helps finance the construction and rehabilitation of rental housing for low-income families and senior citizens.

**Public Housing Modernization Program**

$6.4 million

The Public Housing Modernization Program allocates funds to New York State’s public housing for expenses related to maintenance, improvement, and repairs.

**Main Street Program**

$4.2 million

The Main Street Program helps revitalize and improve village centers and historic downtowns by supplying grants for building renovations, façade and streetscape improvements, and capital funding for projects that will anchor downtown districts. The appearance and functionality of main street buildings often determine the success of community revitalization efforts, and this program creates incentives for strategic investment of public and private resources.
Housing Opportunities Program for the Elderly $1.4 million

The Housing Opportunities Program for the Elderly helps to provide safe, decent, and affordable housing for older adults in New York State. The program offers contracts to not-for-profit corporations and municipalities to provide financial assistance for the administration of emergency home repairs programs, which deliver grants and loans in an amount of up to $10,000 per unit for the cost of correcting any condition which poses a threat to the life, health, or safety of a low-income elderly homeowner.

Access to Home Program $1 million

The Access to Home Program enables individuals with disabilities to live safely and comfortably in their homes by providing funds to help outfit homes with accessibility features such as wheelchair ramps and lifts, handrails, kitchen modifications to create easy-to-reach work and storage areas, and roll-in showers with grab bars, among other improvements.

B. Aid to Localities

Small Cities Community Development Block Grant Program $40 million

The Small Cities Community Development Block Grant Program provides financial assistance to eligible cities, towns, and villages with populations under 50,000 and counties with a population under 200,000. The purpose of this program is to support the growth of affordable housing and suitable living environments. The program also works to expand economic opportunities for persons of low- and moderate-income.

Low Income Weatherization Program $32.5 million

The Weatherization Assistance Program assists income-eligible families and individuals by reducing their heating and cooling costs and addressing health and safety issues in their homes through energy-efficiency measures. Weatherization services reduce the amount of energy required to heat and cool homes and provide hot water, thus reducing energy consumption, while minimizing the impact of higher fuel costs on low-income families.

Housing Development Fund Program $8.227 million

The Housing Development Fund loan fund was established in 1966 under the Private Housing Finance Law and is administered by the New York State Division of Housing and Community Renewal. The purpose of this program is to provide loans to not-for-profit organizations to develop low-income housing projects. These loans may be used for pre-development costs, site acquisition, construction/rehabilitation financing, and other project development costs and to provide short-term financing repaid from equity contributed by investors in low-income housing credit projects.
Local Area Program $4.374 million

The Local Area Program allows for the payment of periodic subsidies to cities, towns, villages, and housing authorities in accordance with the public housing law.

New York City Housing Authority Tenant Patrol Pilot Program $1 million

The Tenant Patrol Pilot Program helps ensure that State-constructed New York City Housing Authority developments remain safe and free from crime by providing monthly stipends to tenants and other volunteers who serve as the “eyes and ears” of the police by patrolling housing developments and community and senior centers. In this year’s budget the Executive proposed eliminating all funding for this program. The Legislature added $1,000,000 to ensure this program continues to receive financial support.

C. The Mortgage Insurance Fund

In the 2016-2017 State Budget, Article VII language transferred over $150 million to utilize reserves in the Mortgage Insurance Fund (MIF) to support programs that target affordable housing, supportive housing, urban and rural preservation, as well as property rehabilitation. The following is a breakdown of how the funding was dispersed to various housing programs:

- $42 million for the rehabilitation of Mitchell-Lama housing projects;
- $31.25 million for the Rural and Urban Community Investment Fund;
- $22.292 million for the Rural Rental Assistance Program;
- $15.69 million for the New York State Supportive Housing Program, the Solutions to End Homelessness Program, the Operational Support for AIDS Housing Program, or to qualified grantees under such programs;
- $12.75 million for the Homes for Working Families Program;
- $10 million to support the Low Income Housing Trust Fund;
- $8.979 million for the Neighborhood Preservation Program;
- $3.739 million for the Rural Preservation Program;
- $2 million for the Mobile and Manufactured Home Replacement Program;
- $600,000 for the New York State Supportive Housing Program;
- $350,000 for costs associated with Naturally Occurring Retirement Communities; and,
- $350,000 for costs associated with Neighborhood Naturally Occurring Retirement Communities.
IV. LEGISLATIVE HEARINGS

A. Cooperatively Owned Housing

On February 19, 2016, the Committee held a hearing that examined the governance and operation of cooperatively owned housing in New York State. Particularly in New York City, co-ops have become a significant source of homeownership, with some buildings critical to low- and middle-income homeownership. A housing cooperative, also known as a “co-op”, is a type of housing that is defined by its ownership structure. In a housing cooperative, a group of individuals have shares of a corporation that owns housing and community facilities.

Given this unique ownership model, co-ops have their own sets of challenges and opportunities, which is why the Committee sought to examine co-ops in order to understand what makes them successful, what areas may need improvement, and how co-ops can best serve their shareholders.

The Committee heard testimony from a number of witnesses, including the Deputy Commissioner of New York City Housing Preservation and Development, the Office of the Manhattan Borough President, several housing advocacy groups and members of the public. Each witness provided testimony from his or her own perspective, which helped the Committee gather insight into how cooperative housing is regulated, in which areas cooperative housing works and others in which it may need improvement, as well as how residents of cooperatively owned housing view the existing governance of cooperative housing.

B. The Status of Mitchell-Lama Housing

On May 25, 2016, the Committee held a hearing on the status of Mitchell-Lama housing. Mitchell-Lama housing, referred to in law as Limited Profit Housing Companies, are an integral part of New York’s affordable housing stock. Mitchell-Lama housing is developed using low-interest mortgage loans and by providing certain real property tax exemptions. As a condition of receiving those benefits, Mitchell-Lama housing developments must be run and managed as not-for-profit companies, have income limitations for residents, and be under the supervision of a state or municipal agency.

Also pursuant to statute, Mitchell-Lama housing companies may dissolve voluntarily and leave the program after 20 years from initial occupancy. Once this happens, any protections provided by the Limited Profit Housing Companies statute no longer apply and once-affordable apartments become subject to market rates and conditions.

Wishing to examine the state of Mitchell-Lama housing developments, their sustainability, and how the Legislature can promote their longevity, the Committee heard testimony from the Commissioner of New York State Homes and Community Renewal, the Assistant Commissioner of New York City Department of Housing Preservation and Development, the Office of the Manhattan Borough President, as well as from several housing advocacy organizations. The testimony provided helped the Committee get a better understanding of the status of Mitchell-Lama housing throughout New York today, which helps the Committee assess current legislation and determine the next steps to be taken.
## APPENDIX A

### 2016 Summary Sheet

**Summary of Action on All Bills Referred to the Committee on Housing**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Final Action</th>
<th>Assembly Bills</th>
<th>Senate Bills</th>
<th>Total Bills</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Bills Reported With or Without Amendment</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To Floor; Not Returning to Committee (Favorable)</td>
<td>20</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>20</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To Ways and Means</td>
<td>10</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>10</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To Codes</td>
<td>21</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>21</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To Rules</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>To Judiciary</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>51</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>51</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Bills Having Committee Reference Changed</strong></td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Senate Bills Substituted or Recalled</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Substituted</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Recalled</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total</strong></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Bills Defeated in Committee</strong></td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Bills Held for Consideration with a Roll-Call Vote</strong></td>
<td>19</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>19</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Bills Never Reported, Died in Committee</strong></td>
<td>171</td>
<td>16</td>
<td>187</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Bills Having Enacting Clauses Stricken</strong></td>
<td>1</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>1</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Motions to Discharge Lost</strong></td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
<td>0</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Bills in Committee</strong></td>
<td>242</td>
<td>17</td>
<td>259</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Total Number of Committee Meetings Held</strong></td>
<td>7</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
# APPENDIX B

## Bills that Passed the Assembly in 2016

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>BILL #</th>
<th>SPONSOR</th>
<th>DESCRIPTION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>A.658</td>
<td>Hevesi</td>
<td>Would require a specific timeline to which the Division of Housing and Community Renewal must adhere to when setting rent reduction schedules in order to provide rent-regulated apartments that have electricity factored into their base rent with a fair reduction at the time submetering begins.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.1477</td>
<td>Wright</td>
<td>Would give New York City Housing Authority tenants notice of their ability to add legal occupants to their leases. Would also ensure that requests for documents to add additional legal occupants are fulfilled.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.3391-A</td>
<td>Braunstein</td>
<td>Would clarify existing and establish new procedures related to refinancing provisions in ground leases. Ground leases are long-term leases of real property that allow the tenant to construct, improve, or renovate structures upon the property.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.3682</td>
<td>Wright</td>
<td>Would initiate a four-year moratorium on the dissolution of any urban Mitchell-Lama rental company and establish a Mitchell-Lama housing program study.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.3728</td>
<td>Wright</td>
<td>Would raise the income limits for families that would be eligible for Mitchell-Lama housing.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.3809-A</td>
<td>Wright</td>
<td>Would prohibit an owner from adjusting the amount of a preferential rent upon the renewal of the lease.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.3957-A</td>
<td>Wright</td>
<td>Would require owners of rent regulated buildings who apply for a major capital improvement (MCI) rent adjustment to first apply for J-51 benefits.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.4102</td>
<td>Wright</td>
<td>Would require the New York City Housing Authority to provide a tenant, upon the denial of any request that would permit a tenant to institute a grievance procedure, with a written notice specifically articulating its reasons for such denial.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.4232</td>
<td>Titus</td>
<td>Would direct the New York City Housing Authority to give mobility-impaired tenants first notice when a unit becomes available on a lower floor.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.5567</td>
<td>Kavanagh</td>
<td>Would repeal laws relating to the allowance of a rent increase upon vacancy of a rent regulated housing accommodation.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.5723</td>
<td>Hooper</td>
<td>Would allow a building owner who has knowledge of a bedbug presence to inspect for bedbugs in the dwelling upon 48 hours’ notice, and would require such owner to keep the premises free from infestations of bedbugs through eradication measures.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.6054-A</td>
<td>Kavanagh</td>
<td>Would establish a new method by which owners of rent-regulated buildings are compensated for major capital improvements (MCIs) by requiring that rent increases associated with MCIs be treated as a surcharge that would not become part of the legal regulated rent. Also, any rent surcharges authorized for MCIs would cease once</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Bill Number</td>
<td>Sponsor</td>
<td>Description</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------</td>
<td>---------</td>
<td>-------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.7617-A</td>
<td>Blake</td>
<td>Would require the State Division of Housing and Community Renewal to promulgate regulations, rules, and policies that provide for the review and determination of compliance with Section 3 of the federal Housing and Urban Development Act of 1968.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>A.7973</td>
<td>Blake</td>
<td>Would require the State Division of Housing and Community Renewal to include in its annual report on the Mitchell-Lama Program information regarding any limited-profit housing company that has voluntarily dissolved in the preceding calendar year or has filed a notice of its intent to dissolve in the upcoming year. Would also require such report to be submitted to the State Comptroller and the Attorney General.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## APPENDIX C

### Chapters of 2016 – Bills Signed into Law by the Governor

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>CHAPTER</th>
<th>ASSEMBLY BILL # (SPONSOR)</th>
<th>SENATE BILL # (SPONSOR)</th>
<th>DESCRIPTION</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>18</td>
<td>A.9205 (Rodriguez)</td>
<td>S.6699 (Perkins)</td>
<td>Clarifies provisions relating to the renewal of sidewalk shed permits.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>72</td>
<td>A.10730 (Weinstein)</td>
<td>S.8141 (Savino)</td>
<td>Establishes the New York State Community Restoration Fund</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>158</td>
<td>A.10497 (Wright)</td>
<td>S.7412 (Little)</td>
<td>Authorizes the State of New York Mortgage Agency to invest in Government National Mortgage Association mortgage backed securities.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>163</td>
<td>A.10668 (Gjonaj)</td>
<td>S.7413-A (Little)</td>
<td>Increases the amount of bond and note authorization totals that may be made by the Housing Finance Agency and the State of New York Mortgage Agency.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>335</td>
<td>A.4102 (Wright)</td>
<td>S.8096 (Little)</td>
<td>Would require the New York City Housing Authority to provide a tenant, upon the denial of any request that would permit a tenant to institute a grievance procedure, with a written notice specifically articulating its reasons for such denial.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>340</td>
<td>A.8140-A (Wright)</td>
<td>S.3342-A (Lanza)</td>
<td>Would require the New York City Housing Authority to inform a tenant over the age of 62 years that he or she has the opportunity to meet with the property manager to discuss the possible termination of tenancy.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>396</td>
<td>A.8704-C (Rosenthal)</td>
<td>S.6340-A (Lanza)</td>
<td>Would prohibit the advertising for certain uses of dwelling units within Class A Multiple Dwellings.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>470</td>
<td>A.10562 (Wright)</td>
<td>S.7895 (Golden)</td>
<td>Would increase the bonding authority of the New York City Housing Development Corporation.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>