



TESTIMONY

2022 Joint Legislative Budget Hearing
Committee on Workforce Development

Ending Forced Prison Labor in New York State
January 31, 2022

The Legal Aid Society
199 Water Street
New York, NY 10038

Prepared by:
Ariel Smallwood, Staff Attorney
Racial Justice Unit
Jacalyn Goldzweig Panitz, Paralegal Casehandler,
Employment Justice Unit
Contact: Ariel Smallwood
(646) 618-3796
ASmallwood@legal-aid.org

TABLE OF CONTENTS

I. <u>THE LEGAL AID SOCIETY</u>	3
A. Racial Justice Unit.....	5
B. 13 th Forward Campaign to End Forced Prison Labor.....	5
II. <u>THE HISTORY OF PRISON LABOR IN NEW YORK STATE IS INEXTRICABLY LINKED TO EXPLOITATION AND THE LEGACY OF CHATTEL SLAVERY</u> ...	6
A. New York’s exploitation of incarcerated labor began with the Auburn system and continues today through Corcraft.....	6
III. <u>THE CURRENT CORCRAFT MODEL SHOULD BE ABOLISHED BECAUSE IT IS EXPLOITATIVE</u>	7
A. The current system creates an ecosystem of products that are only available from Corcraft and are produced through slave labor from dangerous working conditions and low wages.....	7
B. Incarcerated workers are not guaranteed safe working conditions or transferrable skills development to support them post-incarceration and their wages are insufficient to offset the loss of a breadwinner in their families....	9
IV. <u>A PROPOSAL TO CONTRACT PRISON LABOR WITH PRIVATE BUSINESSES WOULD BE REGRESSIVE AND LEAD TO FURTHER OPPRESSION OF BLACK AND LATINX COMMUNITIES</u>	11
A. Allowing private businesses to lease incarcerated labor will further exploit a marginalized population that is already subject to threats, punishment, coercion, and a lack of safety.....	11
V. <u>ENDING FORCED PRISON LABOR IS AN ISSUE OF RACIAL JUSTICE AND IS NECCESARY TO CREATE A MORE EQUITABLE NEW YORK</u>	13
VI. <u>BILLS WE SUPPORT</u>	14
VII. <u>APPENDECIES A AND B</u>	16
VIII. <u>ATTACHMENT- EXHIBIT A</u>	18
IX. <u>ATTACHMENT- EXHIBIT B</u>	20
X. <u>ATTACHMENT-EXHIBIT C</u>	27

We thank the Committee on Workforce Development for the opportunity to provide testimony on the current system of forced prison labor in New York State.

I. THE LEGAL AID SOCIETY

Since 1876, The Legal Aid Society has provided direct legal services to low-income New Yorkers. Over the years, our organization has expanded to become the nation's largest and oldest legal services provider for low-income individuals and families. We specialize in three distinct practice areas: Criminal Defense, Civil Litigation, and Juvenile Rights, where we passionately advocate for our clients in their individual cases, for their communities in our policy work, and for institutional change in our law reform litigation. Each year our staff handles over 300,000 cases throughout New York City, taking on more cases for more clients than any other legal services organization in the United States, and bringing a depth and breadth of perspective that is unmatched in the legal profession. The Society's law reform/social justice advocacy also benefits some two million low-income families and individuals in New York City, and the landmark rulings in many of these cases have a national impact. The Legal Aid Society provides comprehensive representation to many of the most marginalized communities in New York. We are a valuable piece of the New York City tapestry, and our work is deeply interwoven within the fabric of many low-income New Yorkers' lives.

Our Criminal Defense Practice is the city-wide public defender, practicing in each of the five boroughs, annually representing over 200,000 low-income New Yorkers accused of unlawful or criminal conduct on trial, appellate, and post-conviction matters.

The Society's Civil Practice provides comprehensive legal assistance in legal matters involving housing, foreclosure and homelessness; family law and domestic violence; income

and economic security assistance (such as unemployment insurance benefits, federal disability benefits, food stamps, and public assistance); health law; immigration; HIV/AIDS and chronic diseases; elder law for senior citizens; low-wage worker problems; tax law; consumer law; education law; community development opportunities to help clients move out of poverty; prisoners' rights, and reentry and reintegration matters for clients returning to the community from correctional facilities.

The Legal Aid Society's Juvenile Rights Practice provides comprehensive representation as attorneys for children who appear before the New York City Family Court in abuse, neglect, juvenile delinquency, and other proceedings affecting children's rights and welfare. Last year, our staff represented some 34,000 children, including approximately 4,000 who were arrested by the NYPD and charged in Family Court with juvenile delinquency. In addition to representing many thousands of children, youth, and adults each year in trial and appellate courts, The Legal Aid Society also pursues impact litigation and other law reform initiatives on behalf of our clients.

The breadth of our practice and the many ways our work directly connects us with low-income New Yorkers – who are mostly from communities of color – sharply focuses our ability to see the many interlocking ways that our most vulnerable communities are impacted by systemic injustice, discrimination, and neglect. The Society's unique role provides our organization with one of the widest lenses to observe the disparate impact that race, gender, sexuality, and ability has on the lives of people of color in New York. We have challenged those patterns through our litigation and our relentless policy work and won hard earned successes on behalf of our clients and their communities.

A. Racial Justice Unit: The Legal Aid Society formed the Racial Justice Unit in 2018 with the intent to reshape the internal legal practice and advocacy of the Society to center a racial justice lens. The Racial Justice Unit works with each practice to re-examine our work to ensure that we are addressing the societal structures that promulgate racial oppression and inequality as we fight for our individual clients. Since its inception, the Racial Justice Unit has worked with community activists and organizers to promote and advocate for legislative policies that support racial equity. By using litigation, advocacy, and many other tools, the Racial Justice Unit fights against structural racism within New York City and New York State.

B. The 13th Forward Campaign to End Forced Prison Labor: The 13th Forward campaign is comprised of legal advocates, workers' rights groups, and community organizations fighting for fair wages for incarcerated workers and an end to the exception in New York's constitution that allows for forced labor in its prisons. Originally the "Labor is Labor" coalition, 13th Forward seeks to educate New Yorkers about the realities of forced prison labor in our state and works to ensure that incarcerated people can control their own labor. The Legal Aid Society supports this work as a continuation of our commitment to the client populations that we serve. This coalition of over 36 organizations has been organizing since 2019 to address the issue of legalized slavery.

II. GOVERNOR HOCHUL'S FISCAL YEAR 2023 BUDGET PROPOSAL

Governor Hochul's Fiscal Year 2023 Budget proposal ^[OBJ] is not a solution to address the problem of low wages and the state's use of forced labor in New York prisons. Under Article VII Section BB of the Governor's proposed budget, the Governor sets out a plan to permit private businesses to employ the labor of incarcerated individuals. If passed, the bills would merely reintroduce the oppressive and racist convict leasing schemes that advocates have fought to end for decades. Governor Hochul's proposal has two components: 1) Section BB of the Governor's budget – which allows “incarcerated individuals to be employed by and be paid fair and just (wages) by a private sector entity” – and 2) an amendment to the Corrections Law to allow for private businesses to employ incarcerated people.^[OBJ]¹ These proposals are a step backwards for New York State. By creating access to incarcerated people's labor for private companies, New York will be broadening the opportunity for further exploitation of incarcerated people, their labor, and their families' financial well-being. financial well-being.

Currently, the Governor's proposal fails to define what constitutes fair wages and does not include any standard or provision regarding incarcerated workers' safety. Additionally, there is no guarantee that incarcerated individuals will have the ability to refuse to work or if they will have the choice in deciding which industries to participate in. This bill also neglects to provide appropriate labor protections to prevent further economic exploitation of incarcerated workers. Incarcerated people in New York prisons face daily challenges in their workplaces such as extremely dangerous and unsafe labor conditions, complete lack of oversight from the

¹ Public Protection and General Government Article VII Bill NYS FY 2023, (2022).
<https://www.budget.ny.gov/pubs/archive/fy23/ex/artvii/private-sector-employment-incarcerated-cr.pdf>

Department of Labor or any other regulatory body, and no avenues to file complaints if their workplaces or unsafe or if their wages are stolen. These are basic principles that workers should have access to, and yet in New York they do not. Sadly, the Governor's proposal will only increase the likelihood of even further exploitation and harm for incarcerated workers.

Additionally, this bill fails to address the current state of forced slave labor in New York's prisons. For many incarcerated people, they are forced to work against their will while imprisoned. Many incarcerated people have faced retaliation, threats, and even violence for refusing to work. The Governor's bill will only add more fuel to this issue by creating an even greater economic incentive to forcefully compel the labor of incarcerated people. If passed, these proposals will only exacerbate the endemic issue of forced slave labor, economic exploitation, threats, harassment, and retaliation that incarcerated people currently face in New York prisons.

Currently, the state has a monopoly on incarcerated people's labor through a loophole in the state constitution. The text states:

The legislature shall, by law, provide for the occupation and employment of prisoners . . . and no person . . . shall be required or allowed to work, while under sentence thereto, at any trade, industry or occupation, wherein or whereby his or her work or the product or profit of his or her work shall be farmed out, contracted, given or sold to any person, firm, association or corporation, provided that the Constitution of the State of New York legislature may provide by law that such prisoners may voluntarily perform work for nonprofit organizations. . . This section shall not be construed to prevent the legislature from providing that convicts may work for, and that the products of their labor may be disposed of to, the state or any political division thereof, or for or to any public institution owned or managed and controlled by the state, or any political division thereof.²

Thus, the text explicitly rejects the use of incarcerated labor for the profit of private businesses but allows for the state to profit on incarcerated labor through state run business entities like

² N.Y. CONST. art. 3 §24

Corcraft. The second of the Governor’s proposals would change the state constitution to condone the practice of convict leasing that was explicitly rejected within the plain wording of the text.³ The Governor’s proposal is perilous to the safety and stability of incarcerated people and their families. A return to the convict leasing system would further entrench incarcerated New Yorkers into a cycle of debt without any guarantees that they will have marketable skills post-incarceration. The 13th Forward Campaign to End Prison Labor strongly opposes the Governor’s proposal and supports bills S416/A3481 and S308/A3142 to move forward in creating a more equitable New York, not return to the regressive and racist policies of the past.

The New York State Legislature should push back against the Governor’s proposal. There is a long national history of fighting for racial justice and for the rights of incarcerated people. This legislation would be a giant step backwards in our historical fight for a more just society.

III. THE HISTORY OF PRISON LABOR IN NEW YORK STATE IS INEXTRICABLY LINKED TO EXPLOITATION AND THE LEGACY OF CHATTEL SLAVERY

A. New York’s exploitation of incarcerated labor began with the Auburn system and continues today through Corcraft

As the New York State Legislature considers these budget proposals, it is imperative that Section BB and the amendments to the Corrections Laws be fully examined in the appropriate historical context. New York has a long history checkered history surrounding the exploitation of incarcerated people. This state was one of the first states to design and implement the

³ Private Sector Employment for Incarcerated Individuals Continuing Resolution FY 2023 (2022). <https://www.budget.ny.gov/pubs/archive/fy23/ex/artvii/ppgg-bill.pdf>

exploitative practice of forced unpaid labor for incarcerated people. Essentially, creating the template that all other states use today. Over 200 years ago, New York State pioneered the now-ubiquitous “*Auburn System*”, where incarcerated people were forced to work in factories building products to be sold for prison profit.⁴ The jobs were for little or no wages and without basic labor and safety protections. This system spread across the country and evolved into the use of prison industries’ programs today. In New York, Corcraft is the state-run manufacturing enterprise. Incarcerated people are tasked with dangerous jobs creating essential products for the state and managed by Corcraft. Corcraft serves as a stark reminder of how little these exploitative practices have changed over the past 200 years. The legacy of chattel slavery is present within prison walls and has endured from the end of convict leasing and through the civil rights movement and the movement for Black lives.

The targeting of incarcerated populations for their labor has been a common practice through the American experiment. Convict leasing was the practice of requiring incarcerated people (known as “convicts”) to provide work for private businesses. Black people were disproportionately affected and exploited by these practices. The criminal legal system ballooned in order to create offenses that criminalized behavior that was innocuous. Offenses like “vagrancy” and “being outside without work” became codified in a time when white business owners did not want to pay Black workers at the same rate as white workers. Once convicted of an offense, and thus branded as convicts, states would lease out the labor of the people who were incarcerated. In many ways, convict leasing was even more brutal than slavery because there was no incentive to keep incarcerated workers alive. Indeed, there was more of an incentive to push

⁴ *The Auburn System*, Cayuga Museum of History and Art, <https://cayugamuseum.org/the-auburn-system/> (last visited Jan 28, 2022).

workers to work to death because the system was continuously feeding more workers to these businesses through mass incarceration. While this system formally ended in 1943, the use of exploited incarcerated labor continues today.

IV. THE CURRENT CORCRAFT MODEL SHOULD BE ABOLISHED BECAUSE IT IS EXPLOITATIVE

A. The current system creates an ecosystem of products that are only available from Corcraft and are produced through slave labor from dangerous working conditions and low wages

In a terrible link to the past, today's prison labor system looks similar to the convict leasing scheme. Instead of forced labor for the benefit of business, states force or coerce labor from incarcerated people for the benefit of the state. In New York's version of this exploitation, wages range from \$0.10 to \$0.65 per hour.

New York State operates a system of constant exploitation. Incarcerated people are tasked with maintaining the prisons within which they are incarcerated, the production of essential state goods, including the office furniture used by the NYPD, the desks in public school classrooms, and the street signs across our neighborhoods. The NYPD spent over \$13 million on Corcraft products between FY2017 through FY2020⁵. Even institutions of higher learning are receiving these products; SUNY campuses and community colleges purchased over \$1.8 million in Corcraft products over this same period⁶. New York State has created a perverse incentive by relying on products made from the theft and exploitation of incarcerated people's labor. Similar to the discriminatory scheme of convict leasing, we see higher rates of incarceration in Black and Latinx communities across the state thus forcing more Black and Latinx workers into unsafe and

⁵See Appendix A

⁶ See Appendix B

unfair prison labor that feeds the state's desire for cheap products at the expense of Black and Latinx communities. There cannot be a genuine desire to minimize the size and scope of the criminal legal system because each person that goes upstate generates a good or labor that can be bought for literal pennies on the dollar. Dangerous jobs like asbestos removal and firefighting are being done by incarcerated people for slave wages and with little to no training. Further, the use of Corcraft does not significantly subsidize the cost of incarceration: Corcraft's annual 'revenue' accounts for less than 2% of DOCCS' annual budget.⁷

Incarcerated people are responsible for the daily maintenance and operation of the very places in which they are confined, without any of the benefits for their essential labor. The most recent data shows that over 1500 incarcerated people currently work at one of 18 DOCCS facilities.⁸ The Auburn facility where the state's prison labor history began employs over 180 people.⁹ Corcraft has a monopoly on goods that can be purchased and sold by state institutions. Products that are produced include eyeglasses, bookshelves, school desks.¹⁰ Every license plate used in New York State is produced through prison labor.¹¹ In order to provide these products at a rate that the state is willing to pay, the cost of the labor that is used is suppressed to decrease price and increase profit. Organizations have no choice but to use products made from prison labor.

⁷Corcraft's reported revenue for FY2020-21 was \$42 million. DOCCS' FY2020-21 budget was \$3,372,000,000, as reported within the Executive Budget. NEW YORK STATE DIVISION OF THE BUDGET, *Public Safety Briefing Book* (2021), <https://www.budget.ny.gov/pubs/archive/fy21/exec/book/publicsafety.pdf> (last visited Jan 28, 2022).

⁸ It is attached here as Exhibit A.

⁹ Id.

¹⁰ *Brochures & Catalogs*, Corcraft (2022), <https://corcraft.ny.gov/brochures-catalogs> (last visited Jan 28, 2022).

¹¹ NEW YORK STATE OFFICE OF GENERAL SERVICES, *List of Preferred Source Offerings 3* (2021), <https://ogs.ny.gov/system/files/documents/2021/12/the-list-of-preferred-source-offerings.pdf> (last visited Jan 28, 2022).

In this way, the State of New York is deliberately impoverishing its residents in a double hit. First, the wages are suppressed to increase profit. Second, people spend years building skills that will not be applicable once they have served their time in prison. For example, someone who has spent their entire period of incarceration making license plates will not have any transferable skills post-incarceration. Thus, they are unable to save money while incarcerated and unable to earn money post-incarceration. This outcome is not rare. There are thousands of formerly incarcerated people who leave prison without any marketable skills and consequently have a more difficult time finding stability within their communities through jobs.

B. Incarcerated workers are not guaranteed safe working conditions or transferrable skills development to support them post-incarceration and their wages are insufficient to offset the loss of a breadwinner in their families.

Within these facilities, incarcerated people have jobs that reflect skills and opportunities that could be used post-incarceration. According to data from Corcraft obtained through a Freedom of Information Law (FOIL) request, incarcerated people work in high-skilled trades as carpenters, electricians, plumbers, and welders.¹² They possess jobs that contribute to the ecosystem of feeding a community like baker, cook, and farmworker.¹³ They even provide professional skills through jobs like interpreter and nurse aide.¹⁴ However, there is no guarantee of a job that provides transferrable skills or even a guarantee of safety while working in these facilities. Some incarcerated workers have job responsibilities that consist of a great amount of physical danger including chainsaw operator, chipper, construction worker, and fireman helper.

¹² It is attached here as Exhibit B.

¹³ Id.

¹⁴ Id.

Once released, the mere fact of a conviction allows employers to further discriminate against formerly incarcerated people.

For this work, the pay is pennies on the dollar. In response to a FOIL request, DOCCS provided a Food Service Operations Manual that details the wages paid to incarcerated workers. At Grade 1, Step 1 the entry-level wage, incarcerated people make a paltry \$0.10 (ten cents) per hour.¹⁵ The wages increase through grades and steps to only \$0.33 (thirty-three cents) per hour.¹⁶ The highest wage available is a flat rate of \$2 per day at Grade 5.¹⁷ However, the facility caps the number of workers who can be paid at Grade 5. According to DOCCS standards, only one person out of 300 is eligible to make this wage.¹⁸ The devaluation of this labor means that even more money is flowing away from marginalized communities, especially Black, Latinx and Indigenous communities. While incarcerated, the cost of available goods and services is also inflated. A 20-minute telephone call costs \$0.86.¹⁹ At Grade 1, Step 1, an incarcerated person would have to earn more than a standard day's wages in order to speak to their family for only 20 minutes. An incarcerated person cannot meet their own needs with these wages, and they rely on their loved ones to send money. If someone wants to send money to their loved ones through a money transfer, fees create even more of a barrier. A transfer of \$9.99 has a fee of \$2.99 if initiated by phone.²⁰ These loved ones also have limited means themselves and the resources of

¹⁵ It is attached here as Exhibit C. pg. 7, 15

¹⁶ *Id.*

¹⁷ *Id.*

¹⁸ *Id.*

¹⁹ NEW YORK STATE, DEPARTMENT OF CORRECTIONS AND COMMUNITY SUPERVISION, *Telephone Calls*, <https://doccs.ny.gov/telephone-calls> (last visited Jan 27, 2022).

²⁰ NEW YORK STATE, DEPARTMENT OF CORRECTIONS AND COMMUNITY SUPERVISION, *Handbook for the Families and Friends of New York State DOCCS Inmates* 66 (2019), <https://doccs.ny.gov/system/files/documents/2020/01/family-handbook-english-final-12.2019-002.pdf> (last visited Jan 27, 2022).

a family and community are spread even thinner. “Who Pays?”, a report generated by the Ella Baker Center for Human Rights, found that nearly one in five families faced eviction due to the loss of income resulting from their loved one’s incarceration.²¹ Equally shocking, one in three families went into debt to cover phone and visitation costs.²² This contributes to a further push into poverty for many already struggling families. The inability to make a living wage has a ripple effect across communities that affects the community’s ability to thrive.

IV. A PROPOSAL TO CONTRACT PRISON LABOR WITH PRIVATE BUSINESSES WOULD BE REGRESSIVE AND LEAD TO FURTHER OPPRESSION OF BLACK AND LATINX COMMUNITIES

A. Allowing private businesses to lease incarcerated labor will further exploit a marginalized population that is already subject to threats, punishment, coercion, and a lack of safety

The 13th Forward campaign supports the ability for incarcerated people to have the choice to work for fair wages. However, incarcerated people must have the dignity in controlling their own labor and that includes living wages and safe work conditions. A collaboration with private enterprises will not produce safer worker conditions or higher wages for incarcerated workers. Private entities have the incentive of higher profit margins, either with low-cost materials or the use of low-cost labor. There are no protections for incarcerated people on a systemic level regarding wages or harm from on-the-job accidents. In Fiscal Year 2020-2021, Corcraft made

²¹ ELLA BAKER CENTER FOR HUMAN RIGHTS, FORWARD TOGETHER, RESEARCH ACTION DESIGN, *Who Pays? The True Cost of Incarceration on Families* 13 (2015), <http://whopaysreport.org/who-pays-full-report/> (last visited Jan 27, 2022).

²² ELLA BAKER CENTER FOR HUMAN RIGHTS, FORWARD TOGETHER, RESEARCH ACTION DESIGN, *Who Pays? The True Cost of Incarceration on Families* 13 (2015), <http://whopaysreport.org/who-pays-full-report/> (last visited Jan 27, 2022).

profits of \$30 million dollars.²³ In the previous three fiscal years, Corcraft made a total of \$152 million in profit.²⁴²⁵²⁶ This money now goes directly to the state's general fund.

The effect of allowing incarcerated people to be paid pennies on the dollar leads to their labor being devalued while incarcerated and post-incarceration. The state makes more money when it does not pay a fair wage for specialized skills that can only be learned while incarcerated. It is unconscionable that a state would choose to pay unconscionably low wages to its own people to make money for the state. However, it is even more unconscionable that a state would reverse its historical progression to please the interests of business. In this sense, the Governor's proposal has the effect of impoverishing Black and Latinx communities even further. The state could use the revenue from Corcraft to invest in uses that keep people from returning to prison such as housing, education, employment, and healthcare. A partnership with private businesses cuts off a potential lifeline for communities delivers that money to shareholders or business owners.

Both Governor Hochul and the 13th Forward campaign see a vision where New York's incarcerated people have job training that can be applied once they are released from prison. However, without guarantees regarding job placement, higher wages, or protection from exploitation or harm, this promise will lead to the further marginalization of New York's most

²³ OFFICE OF THE NEW YORK STATE COMPTROLLER, *Comptroller's Annual Report to the Legislature on State Funds Cash Basis of Accounting* 64 (2021), <https://www.osc.state.ny.us/files/reports/finance/cash-basis/pdf/cash-basis-annual-2021.pdf> (last visited Jan 28, 2022).

²⁴ OFFICE OF THE NEW YORK STATE COMPTROLLER, *Comptroller's Annual Report to the Legislature on State Funds Cash Basis of Accounting* 64 (2020), <https://www.osc.state.ny.us/files/reports/finance/cash-basis/pdf/cash-basis-annual-2020.pdf> (last visited Jan 28, 2022).

²⁵ OFFICE OF THE NEW YORK STATE COMPTROLLER, *Comptroller's Annual Report to the Legislature on State Funds Cash Basis of Accounting* 65 (2020), <https://www.osc.state.ny.us/files/reports/finance/cash-basis/pdf/cash-basis-annual-2020.pdf> (last visited Jan 28, 2022).

²⁶ OFFICE OF THE NEW YORK STATE COMPTROLLER, *Comptroller's Annual Report to the Legislature on State Funds Cash Basis of Accounting* 68 (2018), <https://www.osc.state.ny.us/files/reports/finance/cash-basis/pdf/cash-basis-annual-2018.pdf> (last visited Jan 28, 2022).

vulnerable populations. The Governor’s proposal is literally a return to the brutal convict leasing scheme that New Yorkers had already repudiated in the state constitution.

V. ENDING FORCED PRISON LABOR IS A RACIAL JUSTICE ISSUE AND IT IS NECESSARY IN ORDER TO CREATE A MORE EQUITABLE NEW YORK

The inclusion of “duly convicted” language of the 13th Amendment to the United States Constitution ensure that the historical wrongs of chattel slavery continue in prisons around the country and within New York State. The probability of being incarcerated in a prison facility is not a matter of chance. Systemic and institutional racism contribute to the policing and disproportionate incarceration of Black and Latinx people. The Data Collaborative for Justice at John Jay College found that over a 16-year period, Black New Yorkers were twice as likely as white New Yorkers to be stopped, arrested, or given a citation.²⁷ Race has a significant impact on bail decisions, plea offers, and sentencing. Sentencing especially has an enormous impact on the systemic overrepresentation of Black and Latinx populations in New York State prisons. Black people are returned to New York prisons for technical violations of parole at approximately five times the rate of white people, and Latinx people are 30% more likely to be incarcerated for a technical parole violation.²⁸ This cycle of incarceration and release is dependent on the targeting of young Black and Latinx people. These same people are used to produce goods and profits for the state while incarcerated and then thrown back into the streets with no training or wages saved from that forced labor.

²⁷ DATA COLLABORATIVE FOR JUSTICE AT JOHN JAY COLLEGE, *Tracking Enforcement Trends in New York City: 2003-2018* 2 (2020), https://datacollaborativeforjustice.org/wp-content/uploads/2020/09/2020_08_31_Enforcement.pdf (last visited Jan 27, 2022).

²⁸ COLUMBIA UNIVERSITY JUSTICE LAB, *Racial Inequities in New York Parole Supervision* 10 (2020), <https://justicelab.columbia.edu/sites/default/files/content/NY%20Parole%20Racial%20Inequities.pdf> (last visited Jan 27, 2022).

VI. Bills We Support

In order to alleviate some of the harms of the current prison labor system, the New York State Legislature must pass S416/A3481 and S308/A3142.

S416/A3481- DOCCS bill to end forced labor

This bill addresses the concerns of incarcerated people and their families in ensuring that no one who is incarcerated will be forced to work. As stated above, many incarcerated people want to work to provide for their needs and the needs of their families. However, under the current DOCCS scheme, forced labor into dangerous industries is routine. Anyone who does not comply is met with punishments including the possibility of time in solitary confinement.

This bill creates a more equitable system of assigning labor, dignity in the choice of labor, and freedom from retaliation. In order to best create stable and dynamic communities, people who are formerly incarcerated should be confident in the fact that the skills they gain while working will have a positive impact on the ability to gain post-incarceration employment. The current system of forced labor further traumatizes people who can contribute a great deal to the labor force if they were able to contribute voluntarily and without the threat of punishment.

The Governor's proposal would have the opposite effect. It signals to incarcerated people that they are not valued members of the labor force and expects them to tolerate any exploitation by the private sector because they are in desperate need of even the smallest amount of wages to send to their families.

S308/A3142- Constitutional Amendment to end forced labor

Unlike many other states, New York does not have a 13th Amendment in the state constitution that mirrors the federal constitution's language. Recently, ballot referendums in

Colorado and Nebraska deleted the language in their state constitutions that legalized slavery for conviction of a crime. New Yorkers have already repudiated the scheme that legalizes slavery for their incarcerated friends and neighbors. While this is an important step in addressing racial justice in New York, it does not go far enough in meeting the needs of these impacted communities, the text of the constitution does not go far enough in ending forced prison labor for profit.

Helping New York’s marginalized communities means further eliminating the state’s interest in forced prison labor. New York can be a trailblazer for racial justice in understanding that our incarcerated neighbors should not be exploited by the state or private enterprises. Everyone, including incarcerated people, deserves to work in an environment that has dignity and fairness at its core. The only way to achieve this for all New Yorkers is to eliminate threats and coercion from all workplaces and to provide fair wages to every worker, especially incarcerated workers.

Appendix A

Total Corcraft Receipts of NYPD Purchases Between FY2017 – FY2020, obtained via Freedom of Information Act Request

FY2017 - 2018	\$4,578,416
FY2018 – 2019	\$6,182,749
FY2019 - 2020	\$3,165,266
Total:	\$13,926,430

Note: Fiscal year runs from April through March.

Appendix B

Total Corcraft Receipts of SUNY and Community College Purchases Between FY2017 – FY2020, obtained via Freedom of Information Act Request

FY2017 - 2018	\$539,382
FY2018 – 2019	\$773,001
FY2019 - 2020	\$495,361
Total:	\$1,807,743

Note: Fiscal year runs from April through March.

EXHIBIT A

EXHIBIT B

EXHIBIT C